#### **KEY TO SOURCES**

J	Green
Е	Green Sans Bold
Р	Blue Sans
RJE	Green with background screen
R	Blue with background screen
Other Independent Texts	Blue Italic
Genesis 14	Green Italic
Dtn	Green Sans Italic
Dtri	Blue
Dtr2	Blue Bold

#### **GENESIS**

In the beginning of God's creating the skies and the earth— 2when the earth had been shapeless and formless,\* and darkness was on the face of the deep, and God's spirit was hovering on the face of the water— 3God\*\* said, "Let there be light." And there was light. 4And God saw the light, that it was good, and God separated between the light and the darkness. 5And God called the light "day" and called the darkness "night." And there was evening, and there was morning: one day.

<sup>6</sup>And God said, "Let there be a space within the water, and let it separate between water and water." <sup>7</sup>And God made the space, and it separated between the water that was under the space and the water that was above the space. And it was so. <sup>8</sup>And God called the space "skies." And there was evening, and there was morning: a second day.

<sup>9</sup>And God said, "Let the waters be concentrated under the skies into one place, and let the land appear." And it was so. <sup>10</sup>And God called the land "earth," and called the concentration of the waters "seas." And God saw that it was good. <sup>11</sup>And God said, "Let the earth generate plants, vegetation that produces seed, fruit trees, each making fruit of its own kind, which has its

<sup>\*</sup>This is one of the passages in P that is reversed in the book of Jeremiah. Jeremiah says, "I looked at the earth, and here it was shapeless and formless, and to the skies, and their light was gone" (Jer 4:23). He is not simply quoting P; he is playing on it and reversing it. In this case he uses its language of creation to describe a vision of the creation being undone: the earth goes back to be an unformed mass, and the light of day goes out. (See *Who Wrote the Bible?* p. 167.) This is one small part of the evidence that P was written by the time of Jeremiah. It is also part of the evidence for establishing the relationship between P and the Deuteronomistic literature (which is associated with the book of Jeremiah; see the Collection of Evidence, pp. 14–15).

<sup>\*\*</sup>The deity is mentioned thirty-five times in the creation account and in every case is called "God" (Hebrew: Elohim), never by the name YHWH.

seed in it, on the earth." And it was so: <sup>12</sup>The earth brought out plants, vegetation that produces seeds of its own kind, and trees that make fruit that each has seeds of its own kind in it. And God saw that it was good. <sup>13</sup>And there was evening, and there was morning: a third day.

<sup>14</sup>And God said, "Let there be lights in the space of the skies to distinguish between the day and the night, and they will be for signs and for appointed times and for days and years. <sup>15</sup>And they will be for lights in the space of the skies to shed light on the earth." And it was so. <sup>16</sup>And God made the two big lights—the bigger light for the regulation of the day and the smaller light for the regulation of the night—and the stars. <sup>17</sup>And God set them in the space of the skies to shed light on the earth <sup>18</sup>and to regulate the day and the night and to distinguish between the light and the darkness. And God saw that it was good. <sup>19</sup>And there was evening, and there was morning: a fourth day.

<sup>20</sup>And God said, "Let the water swarm with a swarm of living beings, and let birds fly over the earth on the face of the space of the skies." <sup>21</sup>And God created the big sea serpents and all the living beings that creep, with which the water swarmed, by their kinds, and every winged bird by its kind. And God saw that it was good. <sup>22</sup>And God blessed them, saying, "Be fruitful and multiply and fill the water in the seas, and let the birds multiply in the earth." <sup>23</sup>And there was evening and there was morning, a fifth day.

<sup>24</sup>And God said, "Let the earth bring out living beings by their kind, domestic animal and creeping thing and wild animals of the earth by their kind." And it was so. <sup>25</sup>And God made the wild animals of the earth by their kind and the domestic animals by their kind and every creeping thing of the ground by their kind. And God saw that it was good.

<sup>26</sup>And God said, "Let us make a human, in our image, according to our likeness, and let them dominate the fish of the sea and the birds of the skies and the domestic animals and all the earth and all the creeping things that creep on the earth." <sup>27</sup>And God created the human in His image. He created it in the image of God; He created them male and female. <sup>28</sup>And God blessed them, and God said to them, "Be fruitful and multiply and fill the earth and subdue it and dominate the fish of the sea and the birds of the skies and every animal that creeps on the earth." <sup>29</sup>And God said, "Here, I have placed all the vegetation that produces seed that is on the face of all the earth for you and every tree, which has in it the fruit of a tree producing seed. It will be food for you <sup>30</sup>and for all the wild animals of the earth and for all the birds of the skies and for all the creeping things on the earth, everything in which there is a living being: every plant of vegetation, for food." And it was so.

<sup>31</sup>And God saw everything that He had made, and, here, it was very good. And there was evening and there was morning, the sixth day.

<sup>1</sup>And the skies and the earth and all their array were finished. <sup>2</sup>And in the seventh day God finished His work that He had done and ceased in the seventh day from all His work that He had done. <sup>3</sup>And God blessed the seventh day and made it holy because He ceased in it from doing all His work, which God had created.

4These are the records of the skies and the earth when they were created:\*

In the day that YHWH God\*\* made earth and skies‡— <sup>5</sup>when all produce of the field had not yet been in the earth, and all vegetation of the field had not yet grown, for YHWH God had not rained on the earth, and there had been no human to work the ground, <sup>6</sup>and a river had come up from the earth and watered the whole face of the ground— <sup>7</sup>YHWH God fashioned a human, dust from the ground, and blew into his nostrils the breath of life, and the human became a living being.

\*Gen 2:4a is the first of ten uses of the phrase "These are the records of . . ." They introduce both narratives and lists; and they introduce texts that come from several different sources. They are the work of the Redactor as a way of editing the source texts of Genesis into a continuous story. The Redactor derived the formula from a text that was originally an independent work, The Book of Records (tôlědōt), which begins at Gen 5:1.

\*\*The text now changes, always referring to the deity by the proper name: YHWH, eleven times. In Genesis 2 and 3 the word "God" appears each time after the name YHWH. But this double identification, "YHWH God," occurs only in these introductory chapters and nowhere else in the Pentateuch. It therefore appears to be an effort by the Redactor (R) to soften the transition from the P creation, which uses only "God" (thirty-five times), to the coming J stories, which will use only the name YHWH.

‡The P creation story begins with "the skies and the earth" (1:1) whereas the J story begins here with "earth and skies," reversing the order. This is not a proof of anything, but it is notable because, from their very first words, the sources each reflect their perspectives. P is more heaven-centered, almost a picture from the sky looking down, while J is more human-centered (and certainly more anthropomorphic), more like a picture from the earth looking up.

This is also an example of the way in which the combining of the sources produced a work that is greater than the sum of its parts. The more transcendent conception of God in P merges with the more personal conception in J, and the result is: the Five Books of Moses in its final form now conveys a picture of God who is both the cosmic God and the "God of your father." And that combined conception of the deity who is both transcendent and personal has been a central element of Judaism and Christianity ever since.

And a boy for a hurt to me, 24 For Cain will be avenged sevenfold And Lamech seventy-seven.

<sup>25</sup>And Adam knew his wife again, and she gave birth to a son, and she called his name Seth "because God put another seed for me in place of Abel because Cain killed him." 26 And a son was born to Seth, him as well, and he called his name Enosh.\*

Then it was begun to invoke the name YHWH.\*\*

'This is the Book of Records‡ of the Human. In the day of God's creating a human, He made it in the likeness of God. 2He created them male and female, and He blessed them and called their name "Human" in the day of their being created. <sup>3</sup>And the human lived a hundred thirty years, and he fathered in his likeness—like his image—and called his name Seth. <sup>4</sup>And the human's days after his fathering Seth were eight hundred years, and he fathered sons and daughters. <sup>5</sup>And all of the human's days that he lived were nine hundred years and thirty years. And he died.

<sup>6</sup>And Seth lived five years and a hundred years, and he fathered Enosh.‡‡ <sup>7</sup>And Seth lived after his fathering Enosh seven years and eight hundred years,

\*The J genealogy traces Adam's line through Cain alone and mentions no other surviving children. The Book of Records genealogy traces Adam's line through Seth and never mentions Cain or Abel. The Redactor added this line explaining that Seth was born to Adam and Eve as a replacement for Abel, thus rconciling the two sources.

\*\*Here the J narrative declares unequivocally that invoking the divine name YHWH began in this early generation of humans on earth. According to E and P, this does not

begin until the time of Moses.

‡The "Book of Records (or: Generations)" is a separate document, used by the Redactor to form a logical framework for the combined sources in Genesis. Within that framework, the stories of J, E, and P now flow through a chronology of the generations from the first humans to the generation of Jacob's twelve sons.

‡‡The two genealogical lists, one from I and one from the Book of Records, have some names that are the same or similar and others that are different, perhaps indicating a common, more ancient source, thus:

Cain Enoch Mehuya-el Mahalalel Metusha-el Lamech

and he fathered sons and daughters. <sup>8</sup>And all of Seth's days were twelve years and nine hundred years. And he died.

9 And Enosh lived ninety years, and he fathered Cainan. 10 And Enosh lived after his fathering Cainan fifteen years and eight hundred years, and he fathered sons and daughters. 11 And all of Enosh's days were five years and nine hundred years. And he died.

<sup>12</sup>And Cainan lived seventy years, and he fathered Mahalalel. <sup>13</sup>And Cainan lived after his fathering Mahalalel forty years and eight hundred years, and he fathered sons and daughters. 14 And all of Cainan's days were ten years and nine hundred years. And he died.

15 And Mahalalel lived five years and sixty years, and he fathered Jared. <sup>16</sup>And Mahalalel lived after his fathering Jared thirty years and eight hundred vears, and he fathered sons and daughters. 17 And all of Mahalalel's days were ninety-five years and eight hundred years. And he died.

<sup>18</sup>And Jared lived sixty-two years and a hundred years, and he fathered Enoch. 19 And Jared lived after his fathering Enoch eight hundred years, and he fathered sons and daughters. 20 And all of Jared's days were sixty-two years and nine hundred years. And he died.

<sup>21</sup>And Enoch lived sixty-five years, and he fathered Methuselah. <sup>22</sup>And Enoch walked with God after his fathering Methuselah three hundred years, and he fathered sons and daughters. 23 And all of Enoch's days were sixty-five years and three hundred years. <sup>24</sup>And Enoch walked with God, and he was not, because God took him.

<sup>25</sup>And Methuselah lived eighty-seven years and a hundred years, and he fathered Lamech. 26 And Methuselah lived after his fathering Lamech eighty-two years and seven hundred years, and he fathered sons and daughters. 27 And all of Methuselah's days were sixty-nine years and nine hundred years. And he died.

<sup>28</sup>And Lamech lived eighty-two years and a hundred years, and he fathered a son 29and called his name Noah, saying, "This one will console us from our labor and from our hands' suffering from the ground, which YHWH has cursed."\* 30 And Lamech lived after his fathering Noah ninety-five years and five hundred years, and he fathered sons and daughters. 31 And all of Lamech's days were seventy-seven years and seven hundred years. And he died.

<sup>\*</sup>This verse appears to have been added to this Book of Records list. This source's pattern does not include giving origins of names anywhere else; like P, it never calls the deity by the name YHWH but only uses Elohim in Genesis; and the cursing of the ground comes from J. Either this verse came from J and was moved to this spot by the Redactor, or else it was written by the Redactor as part of the uniting of the sources in the flood

<sup>32</sup>And Noah was five hundred years old, and Noah fathered Shem, Ham, and Yaphet.

And it was when humankind began to multiply on the face of the ground and daughters were born to them: <sup>2</sup>and the sons of God\* saw the daughters of humankind, that they were attractive, and they took women, from all they chose. <sup>3</sup>And YHWH said, "My spirit won't stay in humankind forever, since they're also flesh; and their days shall be a hundred twenty years."\*\* 4The Nephilim were in the earth in those days and after that as well, when the sons of God came to the daughters of humankind, and they gave birth by them. They were the heroes who were of old, people of renown.

<sup>5</sup>And YHWH‡ saw that human bad was multiplied in the earth, and every inclination of their heart's thoughts was only bad all the day. <sup>6</sup>And YHWH regretted that He had made humankind in the earth.

And He was grieved to His heart.

<sup>7</sup>And YHWH said, "I'll wipe out the human whom I've created from the face of the earth, from human to animal to creeping thing, and to the bird of the skies, because I regret that I made them." <sup>8</sup>But Noah found favor in YHWH's eyes.

#### <sup>9</sup>These are the records of Noah:‡‡

Noah was a virtuous man. He was unblemished in his generations. Noah walked with God. 10 And Noah fathered three sons: Shem, Ham, and Yaphet. <sup>11</sup>And the earth was corrupted before God, and the earth was filled with violence. 12 And God saw the earth; and, here, it was corrupted, because all

\*This is the only occurrence of the word God in narration in all of J in the Masoretic Text. It is not part of the issue of the name of God distinction because it is not independent but is rather part of a fixed phrase, běnê 'ĕlōhîm, which can mean either "sons of God" or "sons of the gods" (plural), meaning divine beings of some sort.

\*\*YHWH sets the maximum age of humans at 120 here in J; but many persons live longer than this (9:29; 11:10-26,32—which come from a separate source, the Book of Records). In J, no one lives longer than 120 years, and it culminates with the report that Moses lives to the maximum of 120 (Deut 34:7).

‡The deity is always referred to by name in the J flood story, ten times; and is always referred to as "God" in the P flood story, sixteen times.

‡‡The Redactor uses the formula "These are the records of . . ." here and in subsequent passages to introduce sections of the story. His use of these words, which recall the opening words of the Book of Records, contributes to the chronology that provides the continuity of the combined narrative in Genesis. (See the notes on Gen 2:4 and 5:1.)

flesh had corrupted its way on the earth. 13 And God said to Noah, "The end of all flesh has come before me, because the earth is filled with violence because of them. And here: I'm destroying them with the earth. <sup>14</sup>Make yourself an ark of gopher wood, make rooms with the ark, and pitch it outside and inside with pitch. 15 And this is how you shall make it: three hundred cubits the length of the ark, fifty cubits its width, and thirty cubits its height. 16You shall make a window for the ark, and you shall finish it to a cubit from the top, and you shall make the ark's entrance in its side. You shall make lower, second, and third stories for it. <sup>17</sup>And I, here: I'm bringing the flood, water on the earth, to destroy all flesh in which is the breath of life from under the skies. Everything that is in the earth will expire. 18 And I shall establish my covenant with you. And you'll come to the ark, you and your sons and your wife and your sons' wives with you. 19 And of all the living, of all flesh, you shall bring two of each\* to the ark to keep alive with you. They shall be male and female. 20 Of the birds by their kind and of the domestic animals by their kind, of all the creeping things of the ground by their kind, two of each will come to you to keep alive. 21 And you, take some of every food that will be eaten and gather it to you, and it will be for you and for them for food." 22And Noah did it. According to everything that God commanded him, he did so.

'And YHWH said to Noah, "Come, you and all your household, into an ark, for I've seen you as virtuous in front of me in this generation. 2Of all the pure animals, take seven pairs, man and his woman; and of the animals that are not pure, two, man and his woman. 3Also of the birds of the skies seven pairs, male and female, to keep seed alive on the face of the earth. <sup>4</sup>Because in seven more days I'll rain on the earth, forty days and forty nights, and I'll wipe out all the substance that I've made from on the face of the earth."

<sup>5</sup>And Noah did according to all that YHWH had commanded him. <sup>6</sup>And Noah was six hundred years old when the flood was, water on the earth.

<sup>\*</sup>The number of animals on the ark is seven pairs of pure and one pair of impure in Gen 7:2,3 (J); but it is only one pair of each, whether pure or impure, in 6:19-20; 7:8,9,15 (P). This fits with the fact that in J Noah will offer sacrifices at the end of the flood, so he needs more than two of each animal—or else his sacrifice would end a species. But in P, there are no sacrifices in the story until the establishment of the Tabernacle in Exodus 40, so two of each animal are sufficient.

<sup>7</sup>And Noah and his sons and his wife and his sons' wives with him came to the ark from before the waters of the flood. 80f the animals that were pure and of the animals that were not pure, and of the birds and everyone that creeps on the ground, 9they came by twos to Noah, to the ark, male and female, as God had commanded Noah. 10 And seven days later the waters of the flood were on the earth. <sup>11</sup>In the six hundredth year of Noah's life, in the second month, in the seventeenth day of the month, on this day all the fountains of the great deep were split open, and the apertures of the skies were opened.\* 12And there was rain on the earth, forty days and forty nights. 13In this very day Noah came, and Shem and Ham and Yaphet, Noah's sons, and Noah's wife and his sons' three wives with them to the ark, 14they and all the wild animals by their kind and all the domestic animals by their kind and all the creeping animals that creep on the earth by their kind and all the birds by their kind, all fowl, all winged things. <sup>15</sup>And they came to Noah, to the ark, by twos of all flesh in which was the breath of life, <sup>16</sup> and those that came were male and female; some from all flesh came, as God had commanded him. And YHWH closed it for him. <sup>17</sup>And the flood was on the earth for forty days, and the waters multiplied and raised the ark, and it was lifted from the earth. <sup>18</sup>And the waters grew strong and multiplied very much on the earth, and the ark went on the face of the waters. <sup>19</sup>And the waters had grown very, very strong on the earth, so they covered all the high mountains that are under all the skies. 20 Fifteen cubits above, the waters grew stronger, and they covered the mountains. <sup>21</sup>And all flesh that creep on the earth—of the birds and of the domestic animals and of the wild animals and of all the swarming creatures that swarm on the earth, and all the humans expired.\*\* <sup>22</sup>Everything that had the breathing spirit of life in its nostrils, everything that was on the ground, died. <sup>23</sup>And He wiped out all the substance that was on the face of the earth, from human to animal to creeping thing and to bird of the skies, and they were wiped out from the earth, and just Noah and those who were with him in the ark were left. 24And the water grew strong on the earth a hundred fifty days.

And God remembered Noah and all the wild animals and all the domestic animals that were with him in the ark, and God passed a wind over the earth, and the water decreased. 2And the fountains of the deep and the apertures of the skies were shut, And the rain was restrained from the skies. 3And the waters went back from on the earth, going back continually, and the water receded at the end of a hundred fifty days. <sup>4</sup>And the ark rested in the seventh month, in the seventeenth day of the month, on the mountains of Ararat. 5 And the water went on receding until the tenth month. In the tenth month, in the first of the month, the tops of the mountains appeared. <sup>6</sup>And it was at the end of forty days, and Noah opened the window of the ark that he had made. <sup>7</sup>And he let a raven go,\* and it went back and forth until the water dried up from the earth. 8 And he let a dove go from him to see whether the waters had eased from the face of the earth. 9And the dove did not find a resting place for its foot, and it came back to him to the ark, for waters were on the face of the earth, and he put out his hand and took it and brought it to him to the ark. 10 And he waited still another seven days, and he again let a dove go from the ark. "And the dove came to him at evening time, and here was an olive leaf torn off in its mouth, and Noah knew that the waters had eased from the earth. 12 And he waited still another seven days, and he let a dove go, and it did not come back to him ever again. <sup>13</sup>And it was in the six hundred and first year, in the first month, in the first of the month: the water dried from on the earth. And Noah turned back the covering of the ark and looked, and here the face of the earth had dried. 14And in the second month, in the twenty-seventh day of the month, the earth dried up.\*\*

<sup>15</sup>And God spoke to Noah, saying, <sup>16</sup>"Go out from the ark, you and your wife and your sons and your sons' wives with you. <sup>17</sup>Bring out with you all the living things that are with you, of all flesh, of the birds and of the domestic animals and of all the creeping animals that creep on the earth, and they will swarm in the earth and be fruitful and multiply on the earth."

<sup>18</sup>And Noah went out, and his sons and his wife and his sons' wives with him. 19 All the living things, all the creeping animals and all the birds, all that creep on the earth went out from the ark by their families.

<sup>\*</sup>In the P creation story, God creates a space (firmament) that separates waters that are above it from waters below. The universe in that story is thus a habitable bubble surrounded by water. This same conception is assumed in the P flood story, in which the "apertures of the skies" and the "fountains of the great deep" are broken up so that the waters flow in. The J creation account has no such conception, and in the J flood story it

<sup>\*\*</sup>P uses the term "expired." J uses the term "died." This is consistent with the rest of P, which uses the term "expired" eleven times, whereas it never occurs in J, E, or D.

<sup>\*</sup>In P Noah sends out a raven. In J he sends out a dove (three times). (In the Epic of Gilgamesh, the hero of the flood sends out a raven, a dove, and a swallow.)

<sup>\*\*</sup>In P the flood lasts a year (or a year and ten days). In J it is the more familiar forty days and nights.

THE BIBLE WITH SOURCES REVEALED. Copyright © 2003 by Richard Elliott Friedman. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America. No part of this book may be used or reproduced in any manner whatsoever without written permission except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical articles and reviews. For information address HarperCollins Publishers, Inc., 10 East 53rd Street, New York, NY 10022.

HarperCollins books may be purchased for educational, business, or sales promotional use. For information please write: Special Markets Department, HarperCollins Publishers, Inc., 10 East 53rd Street, New York, NY 10022.

HarperCollins Web site: http://www.harpercollins.com HarperCollins®, 董\*, and HarperSanFrancisco'\* are trademarks of HarperCollins Publishers, Inc.

FIRST EDITION
Designed by Joseph Rutt

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available on request.

ISBN 0-06-053069-3

03 04 05 06 07 RRD(H) 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

This book is dedicated to Michael Robinowitz for the fiftieth anniversary of our friendship

#### **ADDITIONAL NOTES**

The English translation here is my own. For those who are interested, my explanation of the standards of my translation may be found in my *Commentary on the Torah*, pp. xiii–xvi.<sup>4</sup>

Some of these sources and editorial work extend beyond Deuteronomy. I have presented evidence elsewhere that J continues into a narrative that is distributed through the books of Joshua, Judges, I and 2 Samuel, and the first two chapters of I Kings. P also appears to me clearly to continue into the latter half of the book of Joshua. And DtrI and Dtr2 encompass the books of Deuteronomy through 2 Kings. But these go beyond the scope of this book, which is meant to cover the five books of the Torah.

The process of identifying the sources is a continuing task. Some of the source identifications of verses here are different from those I made in Who Wrote the Bible?, which first appeared fifteen years ago, and which were modified in a second edition. Where these differences occur, readers should regard the identifications in this book as representing my more recent thinking.

I have assembled evidence in other books and articles to show the flaws in recent attacks on the Documentary Hypothesis from the radical and traditional ends of the spectrum. The present book is more concerned with the positive presentation of the evidence on which the hypothesis stands. For those who wish to see the evidence against those recent attacks, see the Appendix in The Hidden Book in the Bible (pp. 350-378); and my articles "Solomon and the Great Histories," in Jerusalem in Bible and Archaeology-The First Temple Period, ed. Ann Killebrew and Andrew Vaughn (Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2002); "An Essay on Method," in Le-David Maskil, ed. Richard Elliott Friedman and William Henry Propp (Biblical and Judaic Studies from the University of California, San Diego; Winona Lake. IN: Eisenbrauns, 2003); "Some Recent Non-arguments Concerning the Documentary Hypothesis," in Texts, Temples, and Traditions: A Tribute to Menahem Haran, ed. Michael Fox et al. (Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 1996), pp. 87-101; and "Late for a Very Important Date," Bible Review 9:6 (1993): 12-16.

# COLLECTION OF EVIDENCE

#### The Seven Main Arguments

The process of identifying the biblical sources took centuries. The process of refining our identifications of these sources has been ongoing, and it continues to the present day. Initially, it was a tentative division based on simple factors: where the name of God appeared in the texts, similar stories appearing twice in the texts, contradictions of fact between one text and another. Accounts of this early identifying and refining may be found in many introductions to this subject and in my Who Wrote the Bible? The collection of evidence here is not a review of that history of the subject. It is a tabulation of the evidence that has emerged that establishes the hypothesis. It is grouped here in seven categories, which form the seven main arguments for the hypothesis in my judgment.

#### I. LINGUISTIC

When we separate the texts that have been identified with the various sources, we find that they reflect the Hebrew language of several distinct periods.

The development of Hebrew that we observe through these successive **per**iods indicates that:

- ◆ The Hebrew of J and E comes from the earliest stage of biblical Hebrew.
- ◆ The Hebrew of P comes from a later stage of the language.
- ◆ The Hebrew of the Deuteronomistic texts comes from a still later stage of the language.
- ◆ P comes from an earlier stage of Hebrew than the Hebrew of the book of Ezekiel (which comes from the time of the Babylonian exile).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>One difference: italics for emphasis in the *Commentary on the Torah* are eliminated here because they might be misunderstood to be a source marker.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>R. E. Friedman, *The Hidden Book in the Bible* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1998).

Collection of Evidence

 All of these main sources come from a stage of Hebrew known as Classical Biblical Hebrew, which is earlier than the Hebrew of the postexilic, Persian period (known as Late Biblical Hebrew).

This chronology of the language of the sources is confirmed by Hebrew texts outside the Bible. The characteristics of Classical Biblical Hebrew are confirmed through comparison with inscriptions that have been discovered through archaeology, which come from the period before the Babylonian exile (587 BCE). The characteristics of Late Biblical Hebrew are confirmed through comparison with the Hebrew of later sources such as the Dead Sca Scrolls.<sup>1</sup>

Despite the power of this evidence, it is practically never mentioned by those who oppose the hypothesis.

#### 2. TERMINOLOGY

Certain words and phrases occur disproportionately—or even entirely—in one source but not in others. The quantity of such terms that consistently belong to a particular source is considerable. Thus:

The mountain that is called Sinai in J and P (twenty times) is called Horeb or "the Mountain of God" in E and D (fourteen times). In thirty-four occurrences of these names, there is no exception to this distinction.

The phrase "in that very day" (*bě'eṣem hayyôm hazzeh*) occurs eleven times in the Torah. Ten of the eleven are in P. (And the eleventh is in R, in a passage that R modeled on P; Deut 32:48.)

The phrase "the place where YHWH sets his name" or "the place where YHWH tents his name" occurs ten times in D but never in J, E, or P.

The phrase "gathered to his people" as a euphemism for death occurs eleven times, and all eleven are in P.

The phrase "fire came out from before YHWH" occurs three times, all in P.

The phrase "and he [or they] fell on his face" occurs eight times, all in P.

The phrase "be fruitful and multiply" occurs twelve times, all in P.

The phrase "YHWH's glory" (kĕbōd yhwh) occurs thirteen times, and twelve are in P.

The word "plague" (ngp) occurs fifteen times; fourteen are in P.

The word "possession" (' $\dot{a}huzz\bar{a}h$ ) occurs thirty-five times in the Torah, and thirty-three are in P. (The thirty-fourth is an R passage repeating a verse from P, and the thirty-fifth is uncertain.)

The word "chieftain" ( $n\bar{a}s\hat{i}'$ ) occurs sixty-nine times in the Torah. Sixty-seven are in P. (The other two are in J and E.)

The word "congregation" (' $\bar{\epsilon}d\bar{a}h$ ) occurs more than one hundred times in the Torah, all in P, without a single exception.

The root 'dp occurs eight times in the Torah, and they are all in P.

The word "property" ( $r\check{e}k\hat{u}\check{s}$ ) occurs in the anomalous source in Genesis 14 (four times) and once in the words of the Redactor. It occurs eight times in the four main sources, and all eight are in P, never in J, E, or D.

The word "complain" (Hebrew lwn and tělûnôt) occurs twenty-three times in the Torah, and twenty-two are in P.

The word "cubit" occurs fifty-nine times in the Torah, and fifty-six are in P.

The term "to expire" (gw') occurs eleven times in P but never in J, E, or D.

The phrase "lengthen your days in the land" occurs twelve times, and eleven are in D.

The phrase "with all your heart and with all your soul" occurs nine times, and all are in D.

The phrases "to go after other gods" and "to turn to other gods" and "to worship other gods" occur thirteen times, all in D.

The phrase "listen to the voice of YHWH" (*šm' bqwl yhwh*) occurs twelve times, all in D.

The term "to lie with" as a euphemism for sex ( $\S kb$ ) occurs thirteen times in the Torah, and eleven are in J. (The other two occur in a single passage in E; Gen 30:15–16.)

The term "to know" as a euphemism for sex (yd') occurs five times in J but never in the other sources.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Robert Polzin, Late Biblical Hebrew: Toward an Historical Typology of Biblical Hebrew Prose (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1976): Gary Rendsburg, "Late Biblical Hebrew and the Date of P," Journal of the Ancient Near Eastern Society 12 (1980): 65–80; Ziony Zevit, "Converging Lines of Evidence Bearing on the Date of P," Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft 94 (1982): 502–509; Jacob Milgrom, Leviticus 1–16, Anchor Bible 3 (New York: Doubleday, 1991), pp. 3–13; Milgrom, "Numbers, Book of," Anchor Bible Dictionary, vol. 4, pp. 1148–1149; Avi Hurvitz, "The Evidence of Language in Dating the Priestly Code," Revue Biblique 81 (1974): 24–56; Hurvitz, A Linguistic Study of the Relationship Between the Priestly Source and the Book of Ezekiel (Paris: Gabalda, 1982); Hurvitz, "The Usage of (Paris: Gabalda, 1982); Hurvitz, "The Usage of "The Case of Semantic Change" in Post-Exilic Writings," Abr-Naharaim Supp. 4 (1995), pp. 1–10; Hurvitz, "The Usage of "The and into the Bible and Its Implication for the Date of P," Harvard Theological Review 60 (1967): 117 121; Ronald Hendel, "Begetting" and 'Being Born' in the Pentateuch: Notes on Historical Linguistics and Source Criticism," Vetus Testamentum 50 (2000): 38–46.

The term "Sheol," identifying the place where the dead go, occurs six times in J but never in the other sources.

The term "to suffer" ('sb) occurs seven times, and all seven are in L.2

#### 3. CONSISTENT CONTENT

#### a) The Revelation of God's Name

This line of evidence is frequently described as a matter of terminology: namely, that different sources use different names for God. But that is not correct. The point is not that sources have different names of God. The point is that the different sources have a different idea of when the name YHWH was first revealed to humans. According to J, the name was known since the earliest generations of humans. Referring to a generation before the flood, J says explicitly, "Then it was begun to invoke the name YHWH" (Gen 4:26). The use of the name by humans may go back even earlier in J, because Eve uses it when she names Cain (Gen 4:1). But in E and P it is stated just as explicitly that YHWH does not reveal this name until the generation of Moses. In Genesis YHWH instead tells Abraham that His name is El Shadday, thus:

YHWH appeared to Abram and said to him, "I am El Shadday." (Gen 17:1)

And then when YHWH speaks to Moses in Exodus, the text says:

And God spoke to Moses and said to him, "I am YHWH. And I appeared to Abraham, to Isaac, and to Jacob as El Shadday, and I was not known to them by my name, YHWH.

(Exod 6:2-3)

The sources in the text are then nearly 100 percent consistent on this matter. The E and P sources identify God as El or simply as "God" (Hebrew: Elohim) until the name is revealed to Moses. After that, they use the name YHWH as well. The J source meanwhile uses the name YHWH from the beginning.

I added one more element to this picture. The J source never uses the word God (Elohim) in narration. When individual persons in the story are

quoted, they may use this word; but the J narrator never uses the word, without a single exception in the Masoretic Text.

For the entire Torah, the picture is as follows: the names YHWH and El and the word God (Elohim) occur more than two thousand times, and the number of exceptions to this picture is three. Despite this phenomenal fact, we still find writers on this subject asserting that "the names of God" do not prove anything.

#### b) The Sacred Objects: Tabernacle, Ark, Cherubs, Urim and Tummim, Moses' Staff and Aaron's Staff

The Tabernacle is mentioned more than two hundred times in P. It receives more attention than any other subject. It is the only permitted site of sacrifice. It is the place where major ceremonies and laws must be carried out. It is the place where all revelation takes place after Sinai. But it is never so much as mentioned in J or D. It is mentioned three times in E.

The ark is identified as being crucial to Israel's travels and military success in J (Num 10:33–36; 14:44), but it is never mentioned in E.

Golden cherubs spread their wings over the ark in P. And cherubs guard the way to the garden of Eden in J. But they are not mentioned in E or D.

In P, the Urim and Tummim are kept in the High Priest's breastplate and are used in apparent divine consultation in judgment. But they are never mentioned in J, E, or  $D.^3$ 

In E, miracles are performed with Moses' staff (Exod 4:2-5,17, 20; 7:15-17,20b; 9:23; 10:13; 17:5-6,8). But in P, it is Aaron's staff that is used for performing miracles (Exod 7:9-12,19; 8:1-2,12-13; Num 17:16-26; 20:8).4

#### c) Priestly Leadership

In the P source, access to the divine is limited to Aaronid priests. In all the stories in P, there are no mentions of dreams, of angels, or talking animals, though these things occur in J, E, and D. As for human leaders: the words "prophet" and "prophesy" occur thirteen times in E and D, but not in P (or J). The single exceptional occurrence of the word "prophet" in P

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>I have limited the cases here to terminology within the Torah itself. For fifty cases of terms that occur disproportionately or entirely in J or in texts related to J that are found in Joshua, Judges, Samuel, and Kings, see R. E. Friedman, *The Hidden Book in the Bible*, Appendix 4, pp. 379–389.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>In the Torah, outside of P, they are mentioned only in the old poem "The Blessing of **Moses**" in Deut 33:8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>The sole possible exception is the P episode of the Red Sea, in which Moses holds his staff as he raises his hand (the same hand or the other one?) over the sea as it splits.

(Exod 7:1) uses the word figuratively, and it refers to the High Priest Aaron himself! Judges, too, are never mentioned in P (as opposed to D, which says: go to the priest and the judges in matters of law). In P, only the Aaronid priests have access to the Urim and Tummim. In P, all other, non-Aaronid Levites are not priests. In P, atonement for sin is to be achieved only by means of sacrifices that are brought to the Aaronid priests. It is not achieved by mere repentance or through divine mercy. Indeed, in P the words "mercy," "grace," "repentance," and "kindness" (hesed) never occur.

This is more than a point of terminology. P not only lacks the terms that express divine mercy; its stories as well convey the merciful side of God far less than the other sources' stories do. For example, in the story of the scouts whom Moses sends into the land, in the J version God says He will destroy the people and start over with a new nation descended from Moses; but Moses intercedes, God relents, and the divine sentence is commuted to forty years in the wilderness instead. But in P there is no such entreaty and relenting; God simply declares the forty-year sentence, and that is that. In both terminology and narrative, P characterizes God as acting according to justice more than as acting according to mercy. If one wishes to be forgiven for an offense, one cannot simply be sorry; one must bring a sacrifice to the priest. As with the absence of angels and prophets, in P the priesthood is the only sanctioned path to God.

In D, on the other hand, all Levites are priests. P regularly refers to "the priests *and* the Levites" (that is, as two separate groups) while D just as regularly refers to "the Levitical priests" (that is, as a single group).

Further conveying the idea in P that priests are the only channel to God, there are no blatant anthropomorphisms in P. In J, God walks in the garden of Eden, personally makes Adam's and Eve's first clothing, personally closes Noah's ark and smells Noah's sacrifice. In E, God wrestles with Jacob and stands on the crag at Meribah as Moses strikes it and water comes out. And in E and perhaps J as well, Moses actually sees the form of God at Sinai/Horeb. In P there is nothing so direct and physical as this. In P such things are metaphorical, as when the Egyptian magicians say that a plague is "the finger of God," or they are mysterious, as when humans are said to be created "in the image of God," which may or may not mean something physical.

#### d) Numbers

Ages, dates, measurements, numbers, order, and precise instructions are an obvious, major concern in P. There is nothing even nearly comparable in degree in J. E, or D.

### 4. CONTINUITY OF TEXTS (NARRATIVE FLOW)

One of the most compelling arguments for the existence of the source documents is the fact that, when the sources are separated from one another, we can read each source as a flowing, sensible text. That is, the story continues without a break. One of the primary purposes of this book is to demonstrate this fact. One can read the texts and see that, when we separate the two flood stories and read each of them (J and P, Genesis 6–9), for example, each reads as a complete, continuous story. And we can observe this kind of continuity through at least 90 percent of the text from Genesis to Deuteronomy.

Specifically, the combined JE text that was assembled by RJE reads as a flowing narrative, with only an occasional gap. When interrupted by material from P or other sources, it picks up after the interruption where it had left off. The P text likewise is a flowing narrative, with only an occasional lacuna. Within JE, each of its source texts, J and E, flows sensibly much of the time as well, but not always. It appears that RJE was willing to make cuts in his received texts (J and E) to a far greater degree than was R in his received texts (JE, P, D, and other, smaller texts).

This high degree of narrative continuity in P also weighs against supplementary versions of the hypothesis, in which some scholars propose that P was never an independent document. They argue that P was rather composed around the JE text as a supplement to it. The narrative flow of P is entirely contrary to these models.<sup>5</sup>

One might object that the scholar has simply divided the text in such a way as to produce this result. But that is not possible. So much of the text flows smoothly in this way that it is not possible that any scholar could have constructed it to do so while keeping all the evidence consistently within sources. The scholar would still have to keep all the sources' similar versions of common stories (known as "doublets") separated. The scholar would still have to keep all the characteristic terminology of each source within the passages attributed to that particular source. The scholar would still have to keep all the linguistic evidence for the stages of Hebrew intact, all the occurrences of the divine name consistent within sources, and all the other lines of evidence intact—all of this while producing stories that flow smoothly. I submit that no such phenomenally consistent results would be possible to construct.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>See William H. C. Propp, "The Priestly Source Recovered Intact?" *Vetus Testamentum* 46 (1996): 458–478, for bibliography and treatment of the arguments on this matter. To my mind, Propp's arguments and evidence weigh definitively against supplementary hypotheses.

## 5. CONNECTIONS WITH OTHER PARTS OF THE BIBLE

When distinguished from one another, the individual sources each have specific affinities with particular portions of the Bible. D has well-known parallels of wording with the book of Jeremiah. P has such parallels with the book of Ezekiel. J and E are particularly connected with the book of Hosea. This is not simply a matter of a coincidence of subject matter in these parallel texts. It is a proper connection of language and views between particular sources and particular prophetic works.

#### a) Jeremiah and D

In treating the book of Jeremiah, it is customary to distinguish the poetic portions of the book from the prose. When we do so, we find that D has marked connections to both the poetry and the prose of the book of Jeremiah. In the poetry, there are at least forty-five occurrences of terms or phrases that are characteristic of D and/or the Deuteronomistic history. For example:

- from the smallest to the biggest
- \* stubborn and rebellious
- + early rain and late rain in its time
- + grain, wine, oil, herd, flock
- ullet they left me
- go after Baal (or: other gods)
- $[d\bar{o}men]$  on the face of the field
- ◆ circumcise your heart<sup>7</sup>
- ♦ they went after emptiness and became empty

When we examine the prose of Jeremiah, we find an even more pervasive array of parallels with the language of D and the Deuteronomistic history. Thirty chapters of prose in Jeremiah have terms and phrases that are characteristic of Dtr. For example:

- with all my heart and all my soul
- ♦ brought them out from the land of Egypt, from the iron furnace
- → all the array of the skies
- ♦ and it will be, if you listen to YHWH
- ♦ they left me and burnt incense to other gods
- ♦ on every high hill and under every attractive tree
- ♦ obstinacy of heart
- ♦ an alien, an orphan, or a widow
- ◆ [God's] name is called on this house
- → cast them out from before His face
- your carcass will become food for every bird of the skies and for the animals of the earth, with no one making them afraid
- ♦ I call witness
- ♦ here, I'm bringing a bad thing
- ♦ everyone who hears it: his two ears will ring
- fire has ignited in my anger

#### b) Ezekiel and P

**Parallels** between P and the book of Ezekiel are at least as noticeable and **striking** as those between D and Jeremiah. For example:

- ◆ The P list of blessings and curses in Leviticus 26 promises blessings "if you will go by my laws, and if you will observe my commandments, and you will do them" (26:3), and it promises curses "if you will reject my laws, and if your souls will scorn my judgments so as not to do all my commandments" (26:14). Ezekiel indicts the people, drawing on those words: "You did not go by my laws, and you did not do my judgments" (5:7).
- ◆ The P curses include "you will eat your sons' flesh" (26:29). Ezekiel threatens, "fathers will eat sons" (5:10).
- ◆ Ezekiel's warnings in that verse also use the word *zrh* for scattering, which likewise occurs in the P curse passage (Lev 26:33); and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>For discussion, history of scholarship, and bibliography on the relationship between Jeremiah and the Deuteronomistic history, see Jack R. Lundbom, "Jeremiah, Book of," Anchor Bible Dictionary, vol. 3, pp. 706–721; R. E. Friedman, "The Deuteronomistic School," in Fortunate the Eyes That See: Essays in Honor of David Noel Freedman in Celebration of His Seventieth Birthday, ed. A. Beck et al. (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1995), pp. 70–80; L. G. Perdue and B. W. Kovacs, eds., A Prophet to the Nations: Essays in Jeremiah Studies (Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 1984); Louis Stulman, The Prose Sermons of the Book of Jeremiah (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1986); S. Mowinckel, Zur Komposition des Buches Jeremia (Oslo, 1914); and Mowinckel, Prophecy and Tradition (Oslo, 1946).

<sup>&#</sup>x27;For a lengthier treatment of these texts, even limiting the cases to language that occurs only in Jeremiah and Dtr and nowhere else in the Hebrew Bible, and further limiting these cases strictly to occurrences of such language that are integral to their poetic contexts and not suspect of having been added secondarily, see Friedman, "The Deuteronomistic School," pp. 76–78.

authorship of J and the Court History, to my The Hidden Book in the Bible.11 For the purpose of this present collection of evidence, I simply note the fact that it is possible to observe a singular connection between the Court History and J, whereas there is no such connection with E, P, or D. This is further strong evidence that I was originally an independent source.

### 6. RELATIONSHIPS AMONG THE SOURCES: TO EACH OTHER AND TO HISTORY

The sources each have connections to specific circumstances in history. And they have identifiable relationships with each other.

# a) J and E and the Kingdoms of Judah and Israel

From 922 to 722, Israel was divided into two kingdoms: the kingdom of Israel in the north and the kingdom of Judah in the south. J has numerous elements that connect it with Judah, and E has numerous elements that

In J Abraham lives in Hebron/Mamre (Gen 13:18; 18:1). Hebron was connect it with Israel:

In J the scouts whom Moses sends see only Hebron and other locations Judah's capital. in Judah; they see nothing of what became the northern kingdom of Israel (Num 17-20,22-24).

In that story, the sole scout who has a positive view is Caleb. The Calebite territory was located in Judah and included Hebron.

In J—and only in J—Judah is a significant figure. There is a narrative about him, the story of Judah and Tamar (Genesis 38). It ends with the birth of Peres, ancestor of the clan from which the kings of Judah were traced. Jacob's deathbed blessing favors Judah and promises his descendants the scepter. Judah's wife is bat sûa' (daughter of Shua), paralleling the name of the wife of David (bat šeba'—Bathsheba) and mother of all the kings of Judah through her son Solomon.12 In J Judah is the brother who saves Joseph from their other brothers' plans to kill him (Gen 37:26-27; 42:22); it is Judah who assures Jacob that he will see that Benjamin will safely go to and return from Egypt (Gen 43:8-9), and it is Judah who speaks for his brothers and defends Benjamin to Joseph in Egypt (44:18-34).

Other elements in J connect with the monarchy of Judah. In J God promises Abraham the land "from the river of Egypt to the great river, the river Euphrates" (Gen 15:18). This matches the borders attributed to David, first king of Judah. In J the root of the name Rehoboam (rhh) occurs six times. (It never occurs in E.) Rehoboam was the first king of Judah as a separate kingdom from the northern kingdom of Israel.

Other elements in I relate to the twelve brothers who become the eponymous ancestors of the twelve tribes of Israel. In I the stories of the births and namings of the brothers cover only the first four: Reuben, Simeon, Levi, and Judah. That is, it reaches only as far as Judah! Moreover, only Judah, out of these four, actually survived as a community with a land of its own. Also, in I there is a report that Reuben has sex with his father Jacob's concubine; and in J there is a story in which Simeon and Levi massacre the men of Shechem. These acts are singled out in Jacob's deathbed blessings when he bypasses these three oldest brothers and promises the monarchy to Judah.

The J story of the massacre at Shechem also casts a negative light on the acquisition of the city of Shechem. Shechem was the capital of the northern kingdom of Israel, built by Jeroboam I, the king who had rebelled

In J there is more about Jacob and Esau than in other sources. And in J against Judah. Esau is identified as the ancestor of Edom. In J there is also a list of the kings of Edom (Genesis 36). And J alone has an account of Israel's encounter with Edom during the journey from Egypt to the promised land (Num 20:14-20). Judah bordered Edom; Israel did not. And it is reported in Samuel and Kings that David conquered Edom and that it remained subjugated to Judah until the reign of Jehoram.

In J the ark is important (Num 10:33-36; 14:41-44), but in E it is never mentioned. The ark was located in Judah, not in Israel.

According to 1 Kings, the symbols of God's presence in Judah were golden cherubs placed over the ark, whereas the symbols of that presence in Israel were two golden calves, erected by Jeroboam 1. Cherubs are mentioned in J but not in E. And in J, in the Ten Commandments, the commandment against idols is stated as forbidding molten gods (Exod 34:17). The golden calves of Israel were molten and are thus forbidden; but the golden cherubs of Judah were not molten. (They were carved from wood

In E, meanwhile, the connections are disproportionately with the northand then gold plated.) ern kingdom of Israel. And, more specifically, they relate to the Levites of the priesthood of Shiloh. Thus:

In E Israel acquires its territory at the city of Shechem, the future capital of Israel, by a purchase rather than by violence (Gen 33:18-19).

<sup>&</sup>quot;A chart in part 4 of the Appendix lists twenty words and phrases that occur only in these texts and nowhere else in the Hebrew Bible, plus over twenty more that occur dis-

<sup>12</sup> bat \$00' and bat \$ebo' are so similar that the two names are confused with each other proportionately in these texts; pp. 379-387. in 1 Chr 3:5.

Josiah, like Hezekiah, establishes exclusive centralization of sacrifice in Jerusalem. The difference is that Josiah's centralization is described in the terms and context of the full Deuteronomistic history that has preceded it, as we have just seen. Hezekiah's reforms are told in a completely different set of terms.<sup>21</sup>

Josiah's reforms are connected to instructions that are found in D; the narrative of Josiah's making those reforms is told in terms and phrases that are typically found in D; and Josiah's reforms are traced to the promulgation of a particular scroll, which is identified by the same words as the scroll that Moses writes in D. This interlocking chain of connections led to the extremely widely held view in scholarship that the scroll that was read in Josiah's day was D. There have been a variety of conceptions: It may have been just the law code that appears in Deuteronomy (chapters 12–26). It may have been the law code and some of the material that precedes and follows it. It may have been written at the time of Josiah. It may have been written earlier and then made public and authoritative in Josiah's time. But there is little room for doubt that D is linked in some integral way to the reign of Josiah.

#### d) P Follows JE

The P narrative follows the JE narrative in content and in the order of episodes: creation, flood, Abraham's migration, Abraham's parting from his nephew Lot, the Abrahamic covenant, Hagar and Ishmael, the destruction of Sodom and Gomorrah, the birth of Isaac, Isaac's marriage to Rebekah, Abraham's death, Jacob and Esau, Jacob's journey to Aram, Jacob's offspring, Jacob's return to Canaan, the change of Jacob's name to Israel, Esau's offspring, Joseph in Egypt, Jacob's journey to Egypt, the enslavement of Israel in Egypt, God's summoning of Moses, the plagues, the exodus, the Red Sea, manna, the theophany at Sinai/Horeb, the giving of law at Sinai/Horeb, the departure from Sinai/Horeb, the spies, rebellion in the wilderness, the heresy at Peor, and Moses' death.

This following of the JE sequence of events is not simply a matter of the Redactor's having arranged the P episodes to match those of JE. We can know this because P, when read on its own, still flows as a continuous text. If it were just a collection of rearranged sections, we would not expect it to flow in this way.

Where P does have a change from what is in JF, we can see the reason for the change in almost every case in terms of the consistent views of the author of P. For example, P, without exception, has no sacrifices until the Tabernacle is established in Exodus 40. P therefore has no story to parallel the J story of Cain and Abel, which involves a sacrifice; P has no sacrifice at the end of the flood story, though J does; P has no sacrifice in the Abrahamic covenant (Genesis 17), though J does (Genesis 15); P has no parallel to the E story of the near-sacrifice of Isaac (and sacrifice of a ram). Also, as noted above, P has no channels to God outside the priesthood, so it never includes angels, dreams, or talking animals, and rarely has a blatant anthropomorphism. P therefore has no parallel to the J story of the garden of Eden, with God walking in the garden and making the humans' clothes, and with a talking snake. Nor does P have the JE Balaam story with the talking ass. P does not have a story of the three angelic visitors to Abraham like that in J. It does not have the story of Jacob wrestling with God or an angel at Peni-El as in E, nor does it have a parallel to the J story of the angel in the burning bush. P does not have the stories of the dreams of Joseph, the drink steward, the baker, and the pharaoh in its account of Joseph.

P does not have the stories of the golden calf or of Moses' Cushite wife, both of which detract from Aaron, the ancestor of the priesthood according to P.

P, on the other hand, has an account of Abraham's purchase of the burial cave of Machpelah at Hebron, while J and E do not; and this fits with the fact that Hebron was a priestly. Aaronid city (Josh 21:13). This story claims a legal holding at Hebron.

Observing this consistent relationship between P and the prior sources is a valuable support for the hypothesis in general, and it helps us to identify the steps by which the sources were formed and the contexts of the sources in history. It reveals that P was composed later than JE, that it was composed by someone who was familiar with J and E in their combined form, and it indicates that P was composed as an alternative to that JE version of Israel's story. It was a retelling of the story in terms that were more suitable to the Aaronid priesthood.

### 7. CONVERGENCE

Above all, the strongest evidence establishing the Documentary Hypothesis is that several different lines of evidence converge. There are more than thirty cases of doublets: stories or laws that are repeated in the Torah, sometimes identically, more often with some differences of detail. The existence of so

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>The account of Hezekiah's reign in fact comes from a separate source that the Deuteronomistic historian used, not from the historian himself. This source covers the kings of Judah from Solomon to Hezekiah. See note 13.

many overlapping texts is noteworthy itself. But their more existence is  $n_{\rm Ol}$ the strongest argument. One could respond, after all, that this is just a majter of style or narrative strategy. Similarly, there are hundreds of apparent contradictions in the text, but one could respond that we can take them one by one and find some explanation for each contradiction. And, similarly there is the matter of the texts that consistently call the deity God while other texts consistently call God by the name YHWH, to which one could respond that this is simply like calling someone sometimes by his name and sometimes by his title. The powerful argument is not any one of these matters. It is that all these matters converge. When we separate the doublets. this also results in the resolution of nearly all the contradictions. And when we separate the doublets, the name of God divides consistently in all but three out of more than two thousand occurrences. And when we separate the doublets, the terminology of each source remains consistent within that source. (I listed twenty-four examples of such terms, which are consistent through nearly four hundred occurrences, above, in the Terminology section.) And when we separate the sources, this produces continuous narratives that flow with only a rare break. And when we separate the sources. this fits with the linguistic evidence, where the Hebrew of each source fits consistently with what we know of the Hebrew in each period. And so on for each of the six categories that precede this section. The name of God and the doublets were the starting-points of the investigation into the formation of the Bible. But they were not, and are not, major arguments or evidence in themselves. The most compelling argument for the hypothesis is that this hypothesis best accounts for the fact that all this evidence of  $\sin$ many kinds comes together so consistently. To this day, no one known to  $\,$ me who challenged the hypothesis has ever addressed this fact.

Thus, I did not list the doublets as one of the primary arguments for the hypothesis above. The primary argument is rather that so many double stories could line up with so many other categories of evidence, composed of hundreds of points of data. With that larger argument in mind, we can now take account of the doublets and add them to the picture in this collection of evidence:

- 1. Creation, Gen 1:1-2:3 (P) and Gen 2:4b-25 (J).
- 2. Genealogy from Adam. Gen 4:17-26 (J) and 5:1-28.30-32 (Book of Records).
- 3. The flood. Gen 6:5–8; 7:1–5,7,10,12,16b-20,22-23; 8:2b-3a,6,8-12,13b,20-22 (J) and 6:9-22; 7:8-9,11,13-16a,21,24; 8:1-2a,3b-5,7,13a,14-19; 9:1-17 (P).

- 4. Genealogy from Shem. Gen 10:21-31 (J and P) and 11:10-26 (Book of Records).
- 5. Abraham's migration. Gen 12:1-4a (J) and 12:4b-5 (P).
- 6. Wife/sister. Gen 12:10--20 (J) and 20:1-18 (E) and 26:6--14 (J). (Triplet)
- 7. Abraham and Lot separate, Gen 13:5.7-11a,12b-14 (J) and 13:6,11b-12a (P).
- 8. The Abrahamic covenant. Genesis 15 (J, E, and R) and 17 (P).
- 9. Hagar and Ishmael. Gen 16:1-2,4-14 ()) and 16:3,15-16 (P) and 21:8-19 (E). (Triplet)
- 10. Prophecy of Isaac's birth. Gen 17:16-19 (P) and 18:10-14 (l).
- II. Naming of Beer-sheba. Gen 21:22-31 (F) and 26:15-33 (J).
- 12. Jacob, Esau, and the departure to the east. Gen 26:34-35: 27:46: 28:1-9 (P) and 27:1-45; 28:10 (J).
- 13. Jacob at Beth-El. Gen 28:10,112,13-16,19 (J) and 28:11b-12, 17-18,20-22 (E) and 35:9-15 (P). (Triplet)
- 14. Jacob's twelve sons. Gen 29:32-35; 30:1-24; 35:16-20 (JE) and Gen 35:23-26 (P).
- 15. Jacob's name changed to Israel. Gen 32:25-33 (E) and 35:9-10 (P).
- **16.** Joseph sold into Egypt. Gen 37:2b,3b,5-11,19-20,23,25b-27. **28b**,31-35; 39:1 (J) and 37:3a,4,12-18,21-22,24,25a,28a,29-30 (E).
- 17. YHWH commissions Moses. Exod 3:2-43.5.7-8,19-22; 4:19-203 (J) and 3:1.4b.6,9-18; 4:1-18,20b-213,22-23 (E) and 6:2-12 (P). (Triplet)
- 18. Moses, Pharaoh, and the plagues. Exod 5:3-6:1; 7:14-18.20b-21, 23-29; 8:3b-11a,16-28; 9:1-7,13-34; 10:1-19,21-26,28-29; 11:1-8 (E) and 7:6-13,19-20a,22; 8:1-3a,12-15; 9:8-12 (P).
- 19. The Passover. Exod 12:1-20,28,40-50 (P) and 12:21-27,29-36, 37b-39 (E).
- **20.** The Red Sea. Exod 13:21–22; 14:5a,6,9a,10b,13–14.19b,20b. 21b,24,27b,30–31 (J) and 14:1–4,8,9b,10a,10c,15–18,21a,21c, 22–23,26–27a, 28–29 (P).
- 21. Manna and quail in the wilderness. Exod 16:2-3.6-35a (P) and Num 11:4-34 (E).